The Forgotten Statesman: Philander Knox and the Politics of the Early 1900s

Mike Bertram

Philander Chase Knox was the most powerful politician to live in our area, but his political achievements have been forgotten. This essay will describe Knox’s life, focusing on his political career from 1901 to 1921 and illustrated by newspaper cartoons from the time. During this period he was Attorney General under McKinley and Roosevelt, Secretary of State under Taft, and Senator for Pennsylvania. He was a candidate for the Republican nomination for President in 1908, but lost the contest to Taft.

Knox’s life can be split into three parts: his youth, the successful lawyer in the last quarter of the 19th century, and the politician from 1901 to 1921.

Knox’s Early Life

Knox was born in 1853 in Brownsville, Pennsylvania, south of Pittsburgh. He was named after a noted Episcopal bishop, Philander Chase, whom his father knew well. His father was a bank cashier.

By 1880, Henry Clay Frick had become a client. Frick supported Knox throughout his career. Andrew Mellon was another early client. Knox cultivated clients in the Pittsburgh business clubs of the time.

Philander Chase Knox was a bright child and after school he went to college. He first went, for a short time, to a college in West Virginia. It is rumored that he was expelled for playing billiards, which was against the college rules. He then went to Mount Union College in Alliance, Ohio. There he was the mainstay of the debating society. Knox graduated in 1872, and the subject of his commencement address was “Science, the destroyer of Poetry.” Knox always liked odd titles for his speeches at college.

While at college he met William McKinley at a debating competition. McKinley, the future President, was a local district attorney. It is said that McKinley was the first person to suggest to Knox that he study law.

The Successful Lawyer

Knox studied law in Pittsburgh and in 1877 formed the firm Knox & Reed in partnership with James Reed. In the rapidly growing industrial center of Pittsburgh, the firm was immediately successful, and still exists today as Reed Smith LLP, one of the largest law firms in the world. In 1880, Knox married Lillie Smith. They had five children.
Frick started his business career with two cousins and a friend in a small partnership, using a beehive oven to turn coal into coke for use in steel manufacturing. He vowed to be a millionaire by the age of thirty. The company was called Frick Coke Company.

Thanks to loans from the family of lifelong friend Andrew Mellon, by 1880 Frick had bought out the partnership. The company was renamed H.C. Frick & Company. It eventually employed 1,000 workers and controlled 80 percent of the coal output in Pennsylvania.

Frick met Andrew Carnegie in New York City while the Fricks were on their honeymoon. This meeting resulted in a partnership between Frick’s company and Carnegie Steel Company. This partnership ensured that Carnegie’s steel mills had adequate supplies of coke. Frick became chairman of the combined company.

Philander Knox was a member of the South Fork Fishing & Hunting Club, a very select summer community for Pittsburgh’s industrialists, founded by Henry Frick and built around Lake Conemaugh. The lake was originally built as part of the “Main Line of Public Works” from Philadelphia to Pittsburgh. The initial route of the Main Line was a combination of railroads, canals, and inclined planes.
There was a canal section east of Pittsburgh, but it suffered from insufficient water in the summer months. Lake Conemaugh, a reservoir, was constructed to overcome this problem. However, the railroad was completed to Pittsburgh before the reservoir was filled, rendering the canal obsolete.

On May 30, 1889, Knox, as secretary of the club, was called by the manager, who was concerned about the rising level of the lake due to a phenomenal storm.

Knox determined to visit the club, but luckily he missed the train. The next day the water topped the dam which then gave way, and the water sped down the valley destroying everything in its path, including swamping the train on which Knox was meant to travel. This was the infamous Johnstown Flood, a catastrophe in which over 2000 people died.

Knox & Reed were appointed to represent the Club and were successful in arguing that the failure of the dam was an act of God.

**Knox & Carnegie**

Knox & Reed became the primary lawyers for Andrew Carnegie, who called Knox “the best lawyer I have ever had.” Workers for Carnegie Steel were on short term contracts. Whenever the economy took a downturn, Carnegie would demand wage reductions when contracts were renewed. Strikes often occurred during these periods.
Andrew W. Mellon

Andrew Mellon was born in Pittsburgh in 1855. His father was Thomas Mellon, a banker and judge. Andrew demonstrated financial ability early in life. In 1872 he was set up in a lumber and coal business by his father and soon turned it into a profitable enterprise. He joined his father's banking firm, T. Mellon & Sons, two years later and had ownership of the bank transferred to him in 1882. He organized financial companies and financed many industrial activities.

Mellon eventually became one of the wealthiest people in the United States. In the mid 1920s, he was the third highest income tax payer in the U.S. behind only John D. Rockefeller and Henry Ford.

Along with his closest friends, Henry Clay Frick and Philander Knox, he was a member of the South Fork Fishing and Hunting Club. Knox served on the boards of many of Mellon’s enterprises.

Andrew Mellon was appointed Secretary of the Treasury by President Harding in 1921. He served in that position until 1932, the third-longest tenure of a Secretary of the Treasury. His service continued through the Coolidge administration and most of the Hoover administration.

Mellon came into office with a goal of reducing the huge federal debt from World War I. To do this, he needed to increase the federal revenue and cut spending. He believed that if the tax rates were too high, then the people would try to avoid paying them. He observed that as tax rates had increased during the first part of the 20th century, investors moved to avoid the highest rates—by choosing tax-free municipal bonds, for instance.

Mellon's policy reduced the public debt (largely inherited from World War I obligations) from almost $26 billion in 1921 to about $16 billion in 1930, but then the Depression caused it to rise again.

Mellon became unpopular with the onset of the Great Depression. He advised Herbert Hoover to "liquidate labor, liquidate stocks, liquidate farmers, liquidate real estate… it will purge the rottenness out of the system." He advocated spending cuts to keep the Federal Budget balanced, and opposed fiscal stimulus measures. In February 1932, Mellon left the Treasury Department and accepted the post of Ambassador to the U. K. He served for one year and then retired to private life.

Mellon served as an alumni president and trustee of the University of Pittsburgh, and made several major donations to the school. In total it is estimated that Mellon donated over $43 million to the University of Pittsburgh.

During his retirement years, as he had done in earlier years, Mellon was an active philanthropist, supporting art and research causes. In 1937, he donated his substantial art collection, plus $10 million for construction, to establish the National Gallery of Art in Washington, D.C.

Andrew Mellon died in 1937.

In 1892, Carnegie wanted to reduce wages by around 20 percent. The main Carnegie plant at that time was at Homestead, PA and the workers took over the plant. Management was unable to get the local sheriff to deputize people to disperse the strikers.

Knox suggested to Frick that a group of Pinkerton security guards should be sent on barges to retake the plant. A gun battle erupted when the barges approached the plant and the Pinkertons eventually surrendered to the strikers.
Knox then went to his friend, Edward M. Paxson, the Pennsylvania Chief Justice, who personally charged the strike leaders with treason. This had a psychological effect on the strikers that, together with eventual action by the sheriff, broke the strike. The total number of people killed is unclear, but was at least ten.

One of Knox’s final acts for Carnegie was to participate in the setting up of U.S. Steel after Carnegie sold out to J.P. Morgan.
There is a lovely story concerning the fees Knox commanded as a lawyer. In one case Knox and General William Henry Harrison, who had been the U.S. President from 1889 to 1893, appeared for the same party. Both Harrison and Knox were very modest men. Harrison inquired of his junior what Knox thought Harrison's fee ought to be.

"What do you think of charging?" asked Knox. "Why," answered Harrison, "I was wondering if $25,000 would be too much; of course, since I am the senior counsel, you, Knox, could not expect such heavy compensation; but do you think our clients would object paying the amount I have named?" "Oh, no," answered Knox, quite casually, "I imagine they will be glad to pay you that sum."

The case went to court and the arguments went back and forth for many days. Then Knox got up to summarize and in a little over an hour demolished the opponent’s case.

So General Harrison received $25,000 for his services, while the fee of Knox was several times that amount. It has been quoted as anything from $50,000 to $250,000.

By 1900, the annual income of Knox & Reed had reached $350,000, and Knox was already a millionaire.
Knox the Politician

Attorney General

Not many people are asked to be Attorney General. Even fewer are asked a second time when they originally reject the position. Knox was one of them. When President McKinley asked him to become Attorney General in 1899, Knox felt that he could not afford to leave his law practice. When the President asked him again to accept the post in 1901, he agreed. On April 9, 1901, he took his oath of office. During his political career Knox generally did not seek political offices; rather, he accepted those that were offered to him.

As Attorney General, Knox initially got the nickname “Sleepy Phil” from the press for his laissez-faire attitude towards the role. As one commentator said, Knox was the quintessential lawyer. He needed a client to give him a case and a fee. Then he would work on the case. If he were given a large fee he would work very hard. McKinley was not a good client, but Knox’s next client was very different.

On September 6, 1901, President McKinley was shot in Buffalo by an anarchist; he died on September 14. Teddy Roosevelt was then sworn in as President.

The Roosevelt Administration

Roosevelt brought McKinley’s body back to Washington in a funeral train. One of the places that the train passed through was Harrisburg. Although the governor and other dignitaries greeted the train, Roosevelt stayed in his carriage. He did not want to be seen mixing with the government of Pennsylvania, which was considered to be one of the most corrupt.

In his autobiography, Roosevelt says that his administration’s two major achievements were the implementation of laws restraining monopolies and cartels, and the initiation of the building of the Panama Canal. Knox was involved in both initiatives.

The Panama Canal

Roosevelt believed that a canal across the Central American isthmus was a strategic necessity. There were two potential routes, either through the Colombian province of Panama or through Nicaragua. A French company, who had successfully dug the Suez Canal, tried to dig a Panama Canal, but was defeated by the jungle and disease.

Roosevelt sent Knox to Paris to ensure that the French company’s title was clear. Then a treaty was negotiated with Colombia, but the Colombian Senate rejected it and asked for more money.

The U.S. was already running a railroad across Panama. The Panamanian province was restive, so when an
insurrection broke out and Colombia sent a shipload of troops to fight the rebels, the U.S. refused to transport them to Panama City. Through skullduggery the force was disarmed; the U.S. then recognized the new Republic of Panama and a treaty was quickly signed using the same terms as those rejected by Colombia.

Roosevelt kept the role of the U.S. secret until after Panama had been recognized. After explaining the situation to his cabinet he asked their opinions. Knox said: “I am sorry you have asked for my opinion because up to the present time the proceedings have been free from any taint of law.”

One of the other cabinet members asked to comment was Elihu Root, a lawyer with a sharp tongue. His comment was: “you have been charged of seduction but you have clearly proved it was rape.”

The Wit of Elihu Root

Root was a lawyer with a sharp wit, as shown by the following examples:

One evening during an argument Roosevelt exclaimed “Oh, go to the devil, Root!” Raising his glass in a mock toast he replied “I come, sir, I come.”

When Root was Secretary of War, the future President, William Taft, was governor of the Philippines. The large, corpulent Taft had been ill but told Root he was feeling better and had gone on an arduous horse ride. Root responded: “Fine, how’s the horse?”

Root sent a birthday message to President Roosevelt in 1904: “Congratulations on reaching the respectable age of 46. You have made a good start in life and your friends have great hopes for you when you grow up.”

Valley Forge

It was in 1903, when Knox was Attorney General in the Roosevelt administration, that he purchased an estate of 256 acres in Valley Forge that included Valley Forge Farm, Maxwell’s, and Knox’s Quarters. The property extended north along Valley Creek into Schuylkill township. All of the property, except the southernmost portion, which is part of the turnpike, is now in Valley Forge Park.

Knox purchased the property from the estate of E. J. Matthews for $56,000. Matthews, who was a director of the Bryn Mawr Ice Company, started to develop the estate in the late 1800s. He was an avid horseman and died in a riding accident. Knox was also an avid horseman. He used to ride with Roosevelt in Washington. Roosevelt called him “my playmate.”

There was another connection between Matthews and Knox; Matthew’s wife was Knox’s cousin.

In 1913 Knox commissioned the famous architect (and later associate charter member of the T. E. History Club), Brognard Okie, to enhance the building. The end of the house shown in the photograph was changed considerably and became the book room. Okie also designed the house across Valley Creek that Knox built for his daughter.

Knox was a keen billiard player. Another enthusiasm, besides horses, was golf. He also played a mean hand of poker, and while in Pittsburgh was a member...
13 of a poker foursome consisting of Henry Frick, Andrew Mellon, George Westinghouse, and himself.

The Knox family’s life at Valley Forge was captured in a contemporary newspaper account:

On the Valley Forge farm the home life of the Knox family is seen at its best. After the official strain at Washington is over Mr. Knox hastens first to Valley Forge. There he plays golf, gallops across the historic acres, walks, reads in his library or on the great veranda, receives and entertains his friends, walks under the shade of the great trees, looks in at the stables where his blooded horses are cared for and, returning, plays poker with any who may care to meet him in the game in which he is an expert. When all this is over he likes to listen to young Phil play ragtime on the pianola, which was put in to please the young man. When not otherwise engaged, Mr. Knox can be found looking at his flock of fine sheep, which he says trims the lawns as they should be trimmed. It is an ideal life at Valley Forge. Every member of the family enters into the spirit of it.

. . .The entrance to the lawn of the home is on the Forge road, one mile from the old village. The mansion stands 200 feet from the pillared gateway. The house is conspicuous on account of the bright yellow hue of the walls and its roof of dark maroon colored shingles. The antique windows are quaint, some of them being glazed in color. Ivy, woodbine, and red Rambler roses clamber about the veranda and the walls. Great native trees shade the lawns. The library, containing thousands of volumes, is on the second floor. A big flat desk on which are strewn the latest periodicals and books stands in the center of the room. Spacious chairs suggest rest and comfort. The drawing room is furnished with solid mahogany. The dining room is in oak.

. . .The industry of the farm is the breeding of fine horses, although there is an extensive dairy on the place which is under the management of Reed Knox, one of the sons, who relieves his famous father of politics by talking of cows and the best way to make butter.

The crack team of the stables, which is always trotted out for visitors, cost $9,000. The chief delight of Mr. Knox is to sit behind this team and engage in spirited brushes with his neighbors. At one time this team held the record, 2:10 ½. It was

Knox’s book room, which now serves as the Park library. Courtesy of Valley Forge National Historical Park.

Copyright © 2020 Tredyffrin Easttown Historical Society. All Rights Reserved. Authors retain copyright for their contributions. This publication or any portion thereof may not be reproduced or used in any manner whatsoever without the express written permission of the publisher. Contact the Society for permission to use any content in this publication. The Society does not accept responsibility for the accuracy of the information herein.
made while Mr. Knox held the ribbons. The performance gained for the owner the reputation of being the best horseman in the United States.

When the family first went to Valley Forge it consisted of Mr. and Mrs. Knox, three sons – Phil junior, Hugh, Reed – and the daughter, Rebecca. . . . The love of the family for this home was expressed by Mrs. Knox to a friend in Washington when she said, “We exist for a few months in our Washington home, but at Valley Forge farm we live.”

All the family reunions are held at this farm. The table in Washington is supplied from Valley Forge farm. The fowl, the vegetables and the fruit are raised on the old home farm. Every new kind of vegetable or special brand of stock or fowl that comes into market is duplicated on the farm. A four horse vehicle, the device of Mrs. Knox, conveys visitors to and from the depot when they go to spend the day at the Knox farm. Another conveyance is an old fashioned coaching car in which big and merry parties are taken out to inspect the farm. . . . While the [Knox’s] Washington home is noted for its hospitality, those who have visited both places, the official residence and the Valley Forge home, declare that there is a difference between the two and that the difference is in favor of the Valley Forge house.

The swimming pool at the Knox estate. Photograph courtesy of Nancy Swane and Valley Forge National Historical Park.

Competition Law

The Sherman anti-trust law was passed in 1890 in an attempt to control monopolies but, in the Knight decision of 1895, the Supreme Court had ruled that the U.S. government, in effect, lacked the power to control trusts or great corporations. This, then, served as an apparently firm basis on which to form all the trusts in the country.

Less than a year after he took his oath of office, those who had called Knox “Frick’s man,” in the mistaken belief that he would be “for big business,” were suddenly the possessors of an inexhaustible supply of crow meat.

For, on February 19, 1902, Knox made known to the press that the Northern Securities Company was to be sued by the United States Government for violating the Sherman Anti-Trust Act.

This announcement fell upon the financial world literally like a bolt from the blue. The fact that J. Pierpont Morgan and James J. Hill were the chief personages concerned did not tend to lessen the impact upon the nation. Morgan was the most powerful financier in the U.S. at the time. President Roosevelt had foreseen this and had asked Knox whether the elder J. P. Morgan could not be omitted from the list of defendants. To this Knox replied: "Well, Mr. President, if you direct me to leave his name out I will do it, but I want to say plainly that in that case I will not sign my name to the bill." So Morgan’s name stayed on.

This suit was, in essence, the attainment of one of the purposes for which Knox entered the Cabinet. Ac-
According to his good friend, Judge James S. Young, of Pittsburgh, Knox accepted the attorney-generalship from President McKinley on the condition that he [Knox] be allowed to solve the trust problem.2

Theodore Roosevelt later gave Knox full credit for initiating this suit when he said: "Not long after I became President, on the advice of the Attorney-General, Mr. Knox, and through him, I ordered proceedings to be instituted for the dissolution of the company. As far as could be told by their utterances at the time, among all the great lawyers in the United States, Mr. Knox was the only one who believed that this action could be sustained. The defense was based expressly on the ground that the Supreme Court in the Knight case had explicitly sanctioned the formation of such a company as the Northern Securities Company."3

The case went through appeal up to the Supreme Court where Knox personally argued it and won. This was the start of modern competition policy in the U.S.

The Northern Securities case did not stop Knox and Morgan from working together on other financial issues while Knox was Secretary of State.

The Senator 1904 - 1908

Senator Matthew Quay of Pennsylvania died at the beginning of 1904. One commentator said on hearing of his death: "he has bought his last vote." In 1901 Frick had suggested to Knox that if he became a Senator and then the Governor of Pennsylvania he would have the possibility of a shot at the presidency.

There are two stories about Knox’s appointment to the Senate vacancy caused by Quay’s death. Both of them may be true. Samuel Pennypacker, the governor of Pennsylvania at the time, said in his autobiography that he proposed Knox.4
After Knox’s success in the Northern Securities case many of the other cartels fell like dominos in a line. *New York Journal, April 30, 1902.*
The other story is that as Attorney General, Knox made himself so obnoxious to the business community that three corporate magnates, A. J. Cassatt, president of the Pennsylvania Railroad, John D. Archbold, of Standard Oil, and Frick, raised $500,000. This money was given to Pennsylvania politicians as soft loans, in order to have him appointed to the vacancy and out of the position of Attorney General.

This was a time before Senate positions were elected by popular vote; rather the state legislators chose the senator. Knox was re-appointed by the Pennsylvania legislature in 1905.

Knox was also proposed by both Roosevelt and Taft (in 1911) for a position on the Supreme Court and as governor of Pennsylvania but turned down all these offers.

The Presidential Candidate

After his victory in 1904 Roosevelt declared that he would not stand for re-election (which would have been his third term). In 1908 Knox was nominated by the Pennsylvania party to be the Republican candidate for president. He was also nominated in 1912, 1916, and 1920 as the “favorite son” of Pennsylvania.

Knox joined a number of other candidates hoping to take advantage of Roosevelt’s popularity. The party’s choice of a presidential candidate was selected by the party convention, rather than in primaries. Roosevelt wanted a candidate who would continue his policies and settled on Taft as his approved successor and ensured that the convention was wrapped up in Taft’s favor and that the other candidates would just have to accept the inevitable.

Senator Philander C. Knox of Pennsylvania, has returned to his country seat at Valley Forge. Knox papers, Library of Congress.
This page, clockwise from upper left: Uncle Sam finds Knox a perfect fit for the Presidency; William Penn shoves Knox into the pool of Republican candidates; the candidates cling to Teddy Roosevelt’s coattails, as Roosevelt wields his famous “Big Stick”.

Facing page, top: The Republican Party (as depicted by Bolivar, a then-famous circus elephant) is courted by Taft, Knox, and other candidates. Bottom: Knox tests his popularity on the “Kalamazoo-meter”, a reference to his February 11 speech to the Lincoln Club in Kalamazoo, Michigan. Taft, meanwhile, tests his strength on the “Ohiometer.”

*All images from the Knox Collection, Library of Congress.*
Excerpted from Vol. 47 No. 1 of the Tredyffrin Easttown History Quarterly
Secretary of State

After his election, Taft nominated Knox as his Secretary of State. Knox helped Taft staff his cabinet. In fact it is said that Knox was the one who really picked the cabinet members. Most commentators do not consider Knox’s term as Secretary of State a success. He had to handle issues in South and Central America as well as the Far East.

There are two initiatives of his term of office that have stood the test of time. Knox made the first attempt to use the U.S.’s financial strength to leverage foreign policy, but although it was not an initial success, it is now a major tool of foreign policy. He also reorganized the State Department.

Knox put a lot of effort into treaties with other major powers after Taft had suggested in a speech that this was a way to sustain peace. Upon reading Taft’s speech, Andrew Carnegie decided that now was the time to set up a Peace Endowment and came to a political bargain with Taft, Knox acting as the go-between. Carnegie asked Elihu Root to be the Endowment’s first president.

In this Clifford Berryman cartoon Uncle Sam concludes that Knox “looks better than ever” as Secretary of State, following his roles as Attorney General and Senator. Berryman created the Teddy bear after Roosevelt refused to shoot a bear that had been captured while he was on an unsuccessful hunting expedition. Knox papers, Library of Congress.
Roosevelt was not happy with Taft’s handling of his policies and the arbitration treaties were the last straw for him. Roosevelt then made an unsuccessful bid for the Republican nomination.

Roosevelt then entered the presidential race as an independent which had the effect of splitting the Republican vote. This allowed the Democrat, Woodrow Wilson in.

After the Wilson administration was installed, Knox stayed in private life until 1916 when he won election to become a Senator for Pennsylvania again.

When President Wilson decided he had to declare war on Germany he sent a draft declaration to the Senate. Knox, a member of the Senate Foreign Relations Committee, pointed out a number of legal defects in the declaration and wrote the declaration that the Senate actually passed.

After the First World War ended, President Wilson went to Paris for six months to negotiate the peace treaties and the establishment of the League of Nations (a precursor to the United Nations). He thought he could force the treaties through the Republican controlled Senate. Knox led a rear-guard action to separate the peace
It is very difficult to get a sense of Knox’s personal opinions and as a researcher to get under his skin. Little he wrote is of a personal nature. Most of his speeches and opinions are of a legal nature, and four Presidents and the Senate certainly valued his expertise in this area.

The launching of action against anti-competitive trusts was a milestone in the commercial policy of the Federal government and probably the high point of his career. It is amazing how somebody who worked hard in the creation of U.S. Steel could so soon afterwards initiate a successful action against Northern Securities.

Whatever you think of Philander Knox, he should not be “The Forgotten Statesman.”

**Knox - the Man**

Knox died in Washington on October 12, 1921 and is buried in the Memorial Chapel Cemetery in Valley Forge.

**NOTES**